

Instructional Materials Selection Guide

October 2023

Table of Contents

- Overview 3
 - Purpose 3
 - The Instructional Materials Selection Process..... 3
- Instructional Materials Selection Planning 4
 - Instructional Materials Selection Review Team..... 4
 - Instructional Materials Selection Review Team Tasks..... 4
 - Instructional Materials Selection Suggested Timeline..... 5
- Analyzing Current Resources 6
- Researching Resources 7
- Narrowing Focus 9
- Making the Final Decision 8

- Appendix 9
 - Instructional Materials Selection - Analyzing Instructional Practices..... 10
 - Instructional Materials Selection Rubric..... 11
 - Instructional Materials Selection - Stakeholder Overview 13

Overview

Purpose

The Instructional Materials Selection Guide aims to assist districts of all sizes through a data-driven decision-making process of analyzing resources to identify ones that align to standards and meet staff and student needs. This guide outlines a universal process for Instructional Materials Selection, while also providing additional tools and examples of how the process might differ depending on content area and size of the district and staff. Districts can use this guide as a part of their district resource review and adoption cycle. It is recommended that school districts schedule their resource review process to align with the [South Dakota Department of Education standards revision timeline](#) to ensure alignment and implementation of the most up-to-date standards.

The Instructional Materials Selection Process

The Instructional Materials Selection Process represents a series of recommended steps to operationalize the complete selection process. The process is composed of six steps:

- 1) Instructional Materials Selection Planning
- 2) Analyzing Current Resources
- 3) Analyzing Instructional Practices
- 4) Researching Resources
- 5) Narrowing Focus
- 6) Making a Final Decision

The phases are designed to engage educators in thoughtful, deliberate, and reflective discussions designed to facilitate data-driven decision making.

Instructional Materials Selection Planning

Instructional Materials Selection Review Team

The Instructional Materials Selection Review Team consists of the individuals responsible for completing the review process. Team members should possess knowledge of the programs and initiatives related to the selected content areas and/or grade levels, and have the capacity (knowledge, skills and availability) to participate throughout the entire process, and the ability to support engagement and implementation of school stakeholders. It is also helpful to include individuals who will be responsible for using the resource selected. The Instructional Materials Selection Review Team should be directed by a team leader who has the authority to identify members, convene meetings, facilitate decision making, and collaborate with district level officials.

Team Members	Team Members
Superintendent, if applicable	Building Principals and/or Assistant Principals
Data resource person(s)	Curriculum or SPED Directors, if applicable
Content area/grade level teachers	ESL and/or SPED teachers, if applicable
Board Members	Instructional paraprofessionals, if applicable
Technology Coordinator	Instructional coaches, if applicable

Instructional Materials Selection Review Team Tasks

The Team Leader of the Instructional Materials Selection Review Team assumes or delegates roles and responsibilities, including:

- Collaborating with the superintendent, local Board of Education, or its designee on expected timeline for purchase.
- Collaborating with the school business manager on budgetary allowance for the purchase.
- Setting a timeline for the project and creating meeting schedules within the timeline.
- Contacting vendors for presentations and sample materials.
- Facilitating a data-driven instructional materials selection process that includes feedback from each team member.

Instructional Materials Selection Suggested Timeline

Step	Description	Approximate Time Frame
Instructional Materials Selection Planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Identify team members. ● Assign roles and responsibilities. ● Develop meeting schedules and timelines for completion. ● Collaborate with BOE on timeline for purchase. ● Collaborate with the business manager on budget and timeline for purchase. 	August/September
Analyzing Current Resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Analyze current resources for alignment with the most recent state content standards available. ● Analyze affiliated documents for alignment (curriculum maps, pacing guides, lesson plans, etc.) ● Complete the Summative Assessment Target Report for ELA/Math with three years of data for targeted grade levels to identify strengths and weaknesses (data from Cambium Assessment Reporting System). ● Contact doeassessment@state.sd.us for help completing this process. 	September/October
Analyzing Instructional Practices for Current Resource	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Analyze schedules, pacing, instructional strategies, interventions, use of supplemental resources and personnel to identify similarities, differences, and trends across classrooms and buildings using Instructional Materials Selection - Analyzing Instructional Practices table. 	September/October
Researching Resources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Request high level overview from vendor(s). ● Request samples, including access to electronic resources and supplemental resources for desired grade levels. ● Review samples using Instructional Materials Selection Rubric. 	October/November/December
Narrowing Focus	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Schedule detailed presentation from vendor(s) curriculum specialists. ● Teach sample lessons from selected resources, including electronic resources. ● Observe other classrooms using resources, if possible. 	January/February
Making a Final Decision	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Request quote from more than one vendor for negotiating purposes. ● Negotiate training and support for teachers to occur PRIOR to the start of the school year. ● Review each grade level's materials order for accuracy. ● Compare salesperson's quote to curriculum representative's quote. Do they match? ● Request a better shipping rate (vendors usually offer 10%, so ask for less). 	March

Analyzing Current Resources

Prior to initiating any type of resource purchase, the Instructional Materials Selection Team must conduct a thorough review of current resources for the specified content area(s) and grade level(s).

During this analysis, the team will review state standards alignment, resource ratings (where available), and student performance as it pertains to the knowledge and skills students gained through use of the resource in targeted content area(s) and grade level(s).

Note: After careful analysis, the team may determine a new resource is not needed at this time.

The table below identifies a recommended process for analyzing a current resource.

Analyzing a Current Resource	
Alignment Activity	Description
Vendor Alignment Documents	<p>Resources may have a stand-alone document aligning the product against state standards. Alternatively, the resource may list standards by unit, topic, or lesson. Team members should compare the vendor provided list of standards against the most recent state standards for the targeted content area(s) and grade level(s) and compile a list of gaps, inconsistencies, or redundancies.</p> <p>Does the current resource align with state standards?</p> <p>To what extent?</p>
Local Curriculum Documents (Maps, Pacing Guides, etc.)	<p>It is possible teachers have made instructional decisions to omit, rearrange, or supplement the current resource. While the resource as prescribed may align with current standards, the way it is being used may not align. Team members should compare local curriculum documents against the most recent state standards for the targeted content area(s) and grade level(s) and compile a list of gaps, inconsistencies, or redundancies.</p> <p>Does the way the current resource is being used align with state standards?</p> <p>To what extent?</p> <p>Would the alignment be stronger if the resource were being used as prescribed?</p>

<p>Student Performance Data</p>	<p>The Instructional Materials Selection Team should review local and state assessment data for the targeted content area(s) and grade level(s) where applicable, to identify strengths and weaknesses in content knowledge and skills as a result of using the current resource. If considering an ELA or Math Instructional Materials Selection, the team should complete the Summative Assessment Target Report (under Assessment Details) with three years of data from the Cambium Assessment Reporting System. This process will help teams identify standard/target trends of strengths and weaknesses in the current instructional materials. Contact doeassessment@state.sd.us for help completing this process.</p> <p>Are there apparent trends in standard/target strengths and weaknesses in the targeted content area(s) and grade level(s)?</p> <p>How do the strengths and weaknesses compare to the current resource standards alignment?</p>
<p>Analyzing Instructional Practices for Current Resource</p>	<p>Teams should review instructional practices and procedures across classrooms and buildings in the targeted content area(s) and grade level(s) to determine their impact on the use of the current resources and its implementation in addressing state standards. Areas to review include schedules, tier I instructional minutes, tier II and III interventions, use of supplemental resources and frequency, use of support personnel, and training or professional development for current staff specific to the resource. Teams can utilize the Instructional Materials Selection - Analyzing Instructional Practices tool.</p> <p>Do current instructional practices and procedures support or impede implementation of the current resource?</p> <p>What are the similarities, differences, and trends in instructional practices and procedures?</p>

Researching Resources

As current resources are analyzed, teams may determine the need to research other resources. Analyzing additional resources makes it possible to compare themes across sources to select that will best address the needs of staff and students. The following strategies are recommended to facilitate researching resources:

- Team leader facilitates the development of a list of possible resources to be considered, using input from content area teachers.
- Team leader communicates with vendors to schedule high level overviews, review pricing structures to ensure alignment with budgetary requirements, and request sample materials, including supplemental resources and access to electronic resources.
- Team members participate in vendor overview sessions; and
- Team members review each sample using the recommended checklist.
- Team members carefully review rubric scores to narrow instructional materials selection to three choices using the [Instructional Materials Selection Rubric](#).

Narrowing Focus

Once the prospective resources list has been narrowed to approximately three choices, the team will further analyze the selected resources in more detail. This will include engaging with vendor curriculum representatives and both using and observing the resource in action. This additional research goes beyond a simple perusal of a student text and ensures confidence in the decision-making process. To narrow focus and provide additional information, the team leader will:

- Communicate with vendors to schedule detailed presentations, including Q & A with vendor curriculum specialists.
- Facilitate team members' participation in vendor detailed sessions.
- Organize team members' planning and teaching sample lessons from selected resources, including electronic resources.
- Schedule opportunities to observe classrooms using the selected resources (in or outside district):
- Organize team members' observation of other classrooms using the selected resources.
- Lead team members in making final decisions on selected resources.

Making the Final Decision

Once the final decision has been made, the team leader will collaborate closely with school leaders, the business manager, technology coordinator (if applicable) and vendor to facilitate the purchase, shipment, and delivery of the selected materials. The Instructional Materials Selection Team will:

- Work with vendor(s) to create a finalized order list of all materials to be purchased.
- Request quotes from more than one vendor for negotiating purposes (if applicable).
- Verify availability of materials and timeframe of delivery.
- Compare each vendor salesperson's quote to the curriculum specialist's quotes for accuracy and delivery dates (do they match? are both individuals ensuring the same materials for the same pricing?).
- Request shipping discounts.
- Prepare and review order forms for accuracy.
- Facilitate communication with vendor(s), business manager, and other applicable school officials to complete the ordering process.
- Upon receipt of materials, review each grade level's order for accuracy.
- Follow district procedures for inventory and distribution of materials.
- Maintain regular communication with vendor(s) regarding resource updates, subscriptions, and accessibility to materials.

Appendix



Instructional Materials Selection - Analyzing Instructional Practices

How do current instructional practices impact student achievement in the targeted grade level(s)/content areas?

Grade Level(s)/Content Area:

Analyzing Instructional Practices	Grade Level / Course	Grade Level / Course	Grade Level / Course	Grade Level / Course
Tier I instructional minutes per day				
Tier II interventions per day				
Tier III interventions per day				
Supplemental resource and frequency of use				
Support personnel during instruction				
Staff training specific to content area/resource				
Staff feedback specific to content area				
Current resource				
Supplies				

Instructional Materials Selection Rubric

Instructional Resource:

Year Adopted:

Grade Level(s)/Content Area:

Rubric	Adequate	Limited (Provide examples to support this rating.)	No Evidence (Provide examples to support this rating.)
Alignment to standards	Strong alignment with state standards. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited connections between standards and content. <input type="checkbox"/>	No alignment between standards and content. <input type="checkbox"/>
Rigor	Instructional strategies, questions, tasks encourage application of higher-level thinking skills and align to the DOK of standards. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited connection between instructional strategies, questions, tasks and application of higher-level thinking skills and align to the DOK of standards. <input type="checkbox"/>	No connection between instructional strategies, questions, tasks and application of higher-level thinking skills and align to the DOK of standards. <input type="checkbox"/>
Usability	Resource provides clear guidance on how to plan, present, and assess content, as well as how to utilize student and ancillary materials to best support student achievement. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited guidance on how to plan, present, and assess content, as well as how to utilize student and ancillary materials to best support student achievement. <input type="checkbox"/>	No evidence of guidance on how to plan, present, and assess content, as well as how to utilize student and ancillary materials to best support student achievement. <input type="checkbox"/>
Assessment	Assessments align to research-based assessment practices and provide criteria for students and teachers and allow continuous evidence of progress. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited evidence of assessment alignment to research-based assessment practices and provide criteria for students and teachers and allow continuous evidence of progress. <input type="checkbox"/>	No evidence of assessment alignment to research-based assessment practices and provide criteria for students and teachers and allow continuous evidence of progress. <input type="checkbox"/>

Rubric	Adequate	Limited (Provide examples to support this rating.)	No Evidence (Provide examples to support this rating.)
Differentiation	Provides teachers with clear strategies and procedures for implementing materials, applying, and extending lessons, remediation and acceleration strategies, and assessment techniques to meet student needs. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited evidence of clear strategies and procedures for implementing materials, applying, and extending lessons, remediation and acceleration strategies, and assessment techniques to meet student needs. <input type="checkbox"/>	No evidence of clear strategies and procedures for implementing materials, applying, and extending lessons, remediation and acceleration strategies, and assessment techniques to meet student needs. <input type="checkbox"/>
Student Technology	Digital resources support student learning, practice, assessment and enhance instruction. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited evidence of digital resources supporting student learning, practice, assessment and enhancing instruction. <input type="checkbox"/>	No evidence of digital resources supporting student learning, practice, assessment and enhancing instruction. <input type="checkbox"/>
Instructor Technology	Digital resources provide content support for teachers, guidance on use of embedded technology tools, and are compatible with district operating systems/hardware/software, and technology capacity. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited evidence of digital resources providing content support for teachers, guidance on use of embedded technology tools, and are compatible with district operating systems/hardware/software, and technology capacity. <input type="checkbox"/>	No evidence of digital resources providing content support for teachers, guidance on use of embedded technology tools, and are compatible with district operating systems/hardware/software, and technology capacity. <input type="checkbox"/>
Supports Local Needs	Resource addresses local student strengths and weaknesses, programs and structures, and supports local continuous improvement initiatives. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited evidence of resource addressing local student strengths and weaknesses, programs and structures, and supports local continuous improvement initiatives. <input type="checkbox"/>	No evidence of resource addressing local student strengths and weaknesses, programs and structures, and supports local continuous improvement initiatives. <input type="checkbox"/>
Training and Technical Support	Teacher training and support is provided/negotiated as part of purchase and will be provided BOTH during implementation and continued use. <input type="checkbox"/>	Limited teacher training and support is provided/ negotiated as part of purchase and will be provided BOTH during implementation and continued use. <input type="checkbox"/>	No evidence of training and support is provided/ negotiated as part of purchase and will be provided BOTH during implementation and continued use. <input type="checkbox"/>

Instructional Materials Selection - Stakeholder Overview

Step	Description	Date Completed
<p>Instructional Materials Selection Planning</p>	<p>Content Area(s): Grade Level(s): Team Leader: Team Members: Projected Decision Date:</p>	
<p>Analyzing Current Resources</p>	<p>Gaps in current resource (if any): Gaps in usage of current resource as evidenced by local curriculum documents (if any): Assessment data analyzed: Student strengths and weaknesses as identified by assessment data:</p>	
<p>Analyzing Instructional Practices for Current Resource</p>	<p>Gaps in instructional practices (if any) including strategies, time, pacing, supplemental support materials, and personnel:</p>	

Step	Description	Date Completed																
<p align="center">Narrowing Focus</p>	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th data-bbox="483 306 686 516">Finalist Title</th> <th data-bbox="686 306 889 516">Vendor Curriculum specialist presentation date</th> <th data-bbox="889 306 1092 516">Sample lesson notes</th> <th data-bbox="1092 306 1295 516">Observation notes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Finalist Title	Vendor Curriculum specialist presentation date	Sample lesson notes	Observation notes													
Finalist Title	Vendor Curriculum specialist presentation date	Sample lesson notes	Observation notes															
<p>Making a Final Decision</p>	<p>Agreed upon resource: Materials list: Vendor quote: Special instructions for office staff/business manager:</p>																	